An Analysis on the Translation of English Noun Phrase into Indonesian in Google Translate

Dwita Normasanti
Faculty of Letters, English Literature
Bulak Kapal Permai blok E no.4 Bekasi Timur
wee_dwita@yahoo.com

An Undergraduate Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of Letters As a Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for Undergraduate Degree in English Literature

Abstract
Machine translation (MT) develops so fast and is demanded by many people because it can be faster than manual translation. One of machine translations which are widely used by people is Google Translate. This research aims to find out errors resulted by Google Translate in translating English noun phrase into Indonesian. The writer uses qualitative method because this research paper conducts a deep observation on the data of which forms are words. The source of the data is taken from the daily English newspaper, named “The Jakarta Post”, April 29th, 2010 edition. The result shows that there are six kinds of error on the translation of English noun phrase into Indonesian resulted by Google Translate, they are the meaning (out of 80 data, there are 41 data which are incorrect (51.25%)), the word order (out of 67 data dealing with the word order, there are 22 data which are incorrect (32.84%)), the noun agreement (out of 42 data dealing with the noun + -s and the irregular form of plurality, there are 11 data which are incorrect (26.19%)), misselection of words with similar meaning (out of 32 data dealing with the multiple meaning words, there are 11 data which are incorrect (34.38%)), misselection of word class (out of 29 data dealing with the changing of word class, there are 10 data which are incorrect (34.48%)), omission (out of 19 data dealing with the words which are not translated, there are 9 data which are incorrect (47.37%)). Out of 80 data, Google Translate could give correct translation on English noun phrase into Indonesian as many as 39 data or 48.75%, while the rest of the data, that is 41 data or 51.25%, are incorrect. Hence, it can be concluded that Google Translate is unable to give correct translation on English noun phrase into Indonesian.

I. Introduction

A. Background of the Problem

The needs of effective, efficient and inexpensive translation in many fields such as mass media and publication make many computational linguists and machine translation
companies compete to achieve the very best and sophisticated machine translation. Machine translation (MT) is the name for computerized methods that automate all or part of the process of translating from one language into another. However, many errors are still resulted by machine translation. If MT can become accurate and efficient enough, it can break down cultural barriers and make communication between speakers of different languages much easier. In addition, the demand for such translations is increasing at a rate far beyond the capacity of the translation profession. There are many reasons why MT develops so fast and is demanded by many people. Translation with the use of machines can be faster than manual translation. Besides, computer aids in translating can also reduce the cost per word of a translation.

As an international language, English often becomes the object of research, particularly in the field of translation. Many of Indonesian researchers are mainly concentrated on the translation between English and Indonesian. In English, structures hold an important role. While in translating uses MT, there are many problems faced. Major issues in MT involve ambiguity, structural differences between languages, and phrases (noun phrase, verb phrase, adjective phrase, adverbial phrase, and prepositional phrase). But here, the writer is only interested in noun phrase.

II. Review of Literature

A. Definition of Translation

Nida and Taber (1974:12) describe that translation consists of reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the source language message, first in terms of meaning, secondly in terms of style.

According to Kahterine Barnwell, on her book, “Bible Translation: An Introductory Course in Principles”, a good translation should be:

- Accurate
  The translator must reexpress the meaning of the original message as exactly as possible in the language into which he is translating.

- Clear
The translation should be clear and understandable. The translator aims to communicate the message in a way that people can readily understand.

- Natural
  A translation should not sound “foreign”. It should not sound like a translation at all, but like someone speaking in the natural, everyday way.

B. Google Translate

Google Translate is one of machine translation tools which uses its own translation software. It is a service provided by Google Inc. to translate a section of text, or a webpage, into another language. The service limits the number of paragraphs, or range of technical terms, that will be translated. It is also possible to enter searches in a source language that are first translated to a target language allowing you to browse and interpret results from the selected target language in the source language. For some languages, users are asked for alternate translations such as for technical terms, to be included for future updates to the translation process.

Google Translate, like other automatic translation tools, has its limitations. While it can help the reader to understand the general content of a foreign language text, it does not always deliver accurate translations. It does not apply grammatical rules, since its algorithms are based on statistical analysis rather than traditional rule-based analysis.

C. Phrase

On “Analyzing Grammar: An introduction”, Paul Kroeger explains that a phrase is a group of words which can function as a constituent within a simple clause.

D. Head of the Phrase

In phrase, we can identify one word as being the most important element. This word is called head of the phrase. According to Maggie Tallerman on “Understanding Syntax”, the head bears the most important semantic information in the phrase. It determines the meaning
of the entire phrase, for instance, *very bright sunflowers*, of which head is sunflowers, is about sunflowers. Besides, the word class of the head determines the word class of the entire phrase.

E. **Noun Phrase**

On “An Introduction to English Grammar”, Greenbaum and Nelson mention that a noun phrase is a phrase whose main word is a noun. The structure of typical noun phrase may be represented in the following way:

- Noun, *e.g.: books*
- Determiner + Noun, *e.g.: those books*
- Pre-modifier + Noun, *e.g.: new books*
- Determiner + Pre-modifier + Noun, *e.g.: some long books*
- Noun + Post-modifier, *e.g.: books on astronomy*
- Determiner + Noun + Post-modifier, *e.g.: some books on astronomy*
- Pre-modifier + Noun + Post-modifier, *e.g.: popular books on astronomy*
- Determiner + Pre-modifier + Noun + Post-modifier, *e.g.: some popular books on astronomy*

III. **Research Method**

A. **Research Design**

In this research, the writer uses qualitative method on analyzing the result of Google Translate in translating English noun phrases into Indonesian. The reason of using this method is because this research paper conducts a deep observation on the data of which forms are phrases instead of numbers.
B. Source of the Data

The data in this research paper are all of the noun phrases taken from the daily English newspaper, named “The Jakarta Post”, April 29th, 2010 edition. The writer took 100 data of noun phrases in that newspaper, but only 80 of them which are analyzed.

IV. Results of Study and Discussion

A. Analysis of the Data

1. Noun phrase which consists of Head

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Google Translate</th>
<th>Correct Translation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand schools and universities say they want overseas students but to be frank they’re not doing enough to attract Indonesians.</td>
<td>New Zealand sekolah dan universitas mengatakan mereka ingin siswa luar negeri tapi terus terang mereka tidak melakukan cukup untuk menarik Indonesia.</td>
<td>Sekolah-sekolah dan universitas-universitas di New Zealand mengatakan bahwa mereka menginginkan pelajar-pelajar dari luar negeri, namun, sejujurnya, mereka tidak melakukan banyak hal untuk menarik para pelajar Indonesia.</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

The translation result made by Google Translate above is incorrect. It is observed from the meaning. In Indonesian, “Indonesian” functioning as a noun, as in the source text above, could mean orang Indonesia (the people of Indonesia) or bahasa Indonesia (Indonesian national language), but Google Translate translated “Indonesians” into Indonesia (name of a country). Besides, according to the context of the source text, it should have been translated into para pelajar Indonesia as seen in the correct translation column. The way Google Translate translated the noun phrase
in the source text above was Indonesia (N). So, the Google Translate output is *Indonesia*.

2. **Noun phrase which consists of Pre-modifier + Head**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Google Translate</th>
<th>Correct Translation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I am not too sure if we will be able to produce <strong>low-cost green cars</strong> next year, but in 2012 it is certain.</td>
<td>Saya tidak terlalu yakin apakah kita akan mampu memproduksi <strong>mobil hijau murah</strong> tahun depan, tetapi pada tahun 2012 itu sudah pasti.</td>
<td>Saya tidak terlalu yakin apakah tahun depan kita akan dapat memproduksi <strong>mobil ramah lingkungan yang murah</strong>, tetapi pada tahun 2012 kita pasti bisa.</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

The translation result made by Google Translate above is incorrect. It is observed from the meaning. Google Translate was unable to give a correct translation on “green cars”. It tended to translate its literal meaning instead of its implicit meaning. “green (hijau) cars (mobil)” was translated into *mobil hijau*, whereas what the source text implies is not green painted cars, but undamaged natural environment cars. It should have translated into *mobil ramah lingkungan yang murah* as in the correct translation column. The way Google Translate translated the noun phrase in the source text above was car (N) + green (Adj) + low-cost (Adj phrase). So, the Google Translate output is *mobil hijau murah*. The Google Translate output is in a clause because there is not connector *yang* before the adjective *murah*.

3. **Noun phrase which consists of Head + Post-modifier**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Google Translate</th>
<th>Correct Translation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The project also provides <strong>footage of</strong></td>
<td>Proyek ini juga menyediakan <strong>rekaman</strong></td>
<td>Proyek ini juga memberikan <strong>rekaman</strong></td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Discussion**

The translation result made by Google Translate above is incorrect. It is observed from the meaning and the word class changing. According to the context of the source text above, the noun phrase implies footage when Prince Charles interviewed former US vice president, Al Gore. While in the Google Translate output, it implies interview footage of Prince Charles, a former US vice president. Besides, the word “interviewing” (sedang mewawancarai), which is a verb, is translated into wawancara (interview), which is a noun. The correct translation should have been *rekaman saat Pangeran Charles mewawancarai mantan wakil presiden AS* as seen in the correct translation column. The way Google Translate translated the noun phrase in the source text above was *footage (N) + interview (N) + Prince Charles (N) + former (Adj) + vice (Prefix) + president (N) + US (N)*. So, the Google Translate output was *rekaman wawancara Pangeran Charles mantan wakil presiden AS*.

4. **Noun phrase which consists of Pre-modifier + Head + Post-modifier**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Google Translate</th>
<th>Correct Translation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Area residents mostly approve of the way some owners of idle land help low-income people living in the vicinity.</td>
<td>Luas penduduk sebagian besar setuju dengan cara beberapa pemilik tanah idle membantu berpenghasilan rendah orang yang</td>
<td>Penduduk daerah setempat sebagian besar setuju dengan cara beberapa pemilik lahan kosong dalam membantu orang-orang</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion

The translation result made by Google Translate above is incorrect. It is observed from the head positioning and the irregular form of plurality. In Indonesian noun phrase, the head should precede the pre-modifier. In the Google Translate output, the head “people” (orang-orang) comes after the pre-modifier “low-income” (berpenghasilan rendah). Besides, the plural form of “people” (orang-orang) is translated into singular form, that is, orang (person). It makes the sense in the noun phrase above changes. The noun phrase in the source text above implies the people who are living in the vicinity have low wages, but the Google Translate output implies only one person who is living in the vicinity has low wages. The correct translation can be seen in the correct translation column, that is, orang-orang berpenghasilan rendah yang tinggal di sekitarnya. The way Google Translate translated the noun phrase in the source text above was low-income (Adj phrase) + person (N) + living (Adj) + in (Prep) + vicinity (N). So, the Google Translate output is berpenghasilan rendah orang yang tinggal di sekitarnya.

5. Noun phrase which consists of Determiner + Head

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Google Translate</th>
<th>Correct Translation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>But unlike their counterparts in Cakung, these farmers use idle land situated inside a residential complex.</td>
<td>Tapi tidak seperti rekan-rekan mereka di Cakung. para petani menggunakan lahan kosong yang terletak di dalam kompleks perumahan.</td>
<td>Tetapi tidak seperti rekan-rekan mereka di Cakung. para petani ini memanfaatkan lahan kosong yang terletak di dalam kompleks perumahan.</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Discussion**

The translation result made by Google Translate above is incorrect. It is observed from the untranslated word and the meaning. The noun phrase “these farmers” in the source text above implies the farmers around the area. But Google Translate did not translate the determiner “these” (*ini*), which makes the Google Translate output above unclear because it does not convey which farmers that is meant. It should have translated the determiner “these” to make it clear, as seen in the correct translation column, that is, *para pertani ini*. The way Google Translate translated the noun phrase in the source text above was farmers (N). So, the Google Translate output is *para petani*.

6. **Noun phrase which consists of Determiner + Pre-modifier + Head**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Google Translate</th>
<th>Correct Translation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yangon has maintained good economic relation with its two giant neighbors, China and India.</td>
<td>Yangon telah mempertahankan hubungan ekonomi yang baik dengan dua tetangga raksasa, Cina dan India.</td>
<td>Yangon telah mempertahankan hubungan perekonomian yang baik dengan dua negara tetangga besarnya, yaitu Cina dan India.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

The translation result made by Google Translate above is incorrect. It is observed from the meaning, the misselection of multiple meaning word, and the word which is not translated. Observing from the context of the source text above, the head “neighbors” implies countries which are near to another, but Google Translate translated it into *tetangga* (people who live in house that is near to one another). In short, Google Translate tended to translate the literal meaning of “neighbors” instead of its implicit meaning. Besides, the word “giant”, which implies big, is translated into *raksasa*, which means a very huge creature. In addition, the determiner “its” (-*nya*) is
not translated. The correct translation can be seen in the correct translation column, that is, *dua negara tetangga besarnya*. The way Google Translate translated the noun phrase in the source text above was two (Adj) + neighbors (N) + gient (Adj). So, the Google Translate output is *dua tetangga raksasa*.

7. **Noun phrase which consists of Determiner + Head + Post-modifier**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Google Translate</th>
<th>Correct Translation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The crisis threatens to undermine the euro and make it harder and more expensive for all eurozone governments to borrow money.</td>
<td>Krisis ini mengancam melemahkan euro dan membuatnya lebih sulit dan mahal untuk semua pemerintah zona euro untuk meminjam uang.</td>
<td>Krisis ini dapat melemahkan euro dan membuatnya lebih sulit dan lebih mahal bagi semua pemerintah negara bermata uang euro dalam meminjam uang.</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

The translation result made by Google Translate above is incorrect. It is observed from the meaning. Google Translate was unable to give a correct translation on “eurozone”. It tended to translate its literal meaning instead of its implicit meaning, that is, *zona euro*. Whereas, “eurozone” in the noun phrase in the source text above implies countries whose currency is euro. The correct translation should have been *semua pemerintah negara bermata uang euro dalam meminjam uang* as seen in the correct translation column. The way Google Translate translated the noun phrase in the source text above was all (Det) + governments (N) + zona (N) + euro (N) + to (Prep) + borrow (V) + money (N). So, the Google Translate output is *semua pemerintah zona euro untuk meminjam uang*. 
8. Noun phrase which consists of Determiner + Pre-modifier + Head + Post-modifier

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Google Translate</th>
<th>Correct Translation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In Bangkok, the troops had formed a roadblock to stop about 2000 “red shirts” protesters who left their main protest site in central Bangkok’s shopping district.</td>
<td>Di Bangkok, pasukan telah membentuk penghalang untuk berhenti sekitar 2000 &quot;kaos merah&quot; pengunjuk rasa yang meninggalkan lokasi protes utama mereka di distrik perbelanjaan Bangkok pusat.</td>
<td>Di Bangkok, para tentara telah membentuk penghalang untuk menghentikan sekitar 2000 pengunjuk rasa berkaos merah yang meninggalkan lokasi utama unjuk rasa mereka di pusat daerah perbelanjaan Bangkok.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

The translation result made by Google Translate above is incorrect. It is observed from the meaning and the word order. Google Translate tended to translate the pre-modifier “red shirt” into its literal meaning instead of its implicit meaning, that is, “red” (merah) “shirt” (kaos), while according to the context of the source text above, it implies protesters who were wearing shirts with the color of red. Besides, it should have been placed after the head “protesters” (pengunjuk rasa). In addition, “protesters” should have followed the determiner “2000” as seen in the correct translation column, that is, 2000 pengunjuk rasa berkaos merah yang meninggalkan lokasi utama unjuk rasa mereka. But, the translation of “their main protest site” in the Google Translate output (lokasi protes utama mereka) and in the correct translation result (lokasi utama unjuk rasa mereka), imply the same meaning. The way Google Translate translated the noun phrase in the source text above was 2000 (Det) + shirt (N) + red (Adj) + protesters (N) + who (Pron) + left (V) + location (N) + protest (N) + main (Adj) + their (Pron). So, the Google Translate output is 2000 "kaos merah" pengunjuk rasa yang meninggalkan lokasi protes utama mereka.
B. Discussion

Based on the data which have been collected and analyzed by the writer, it is found that there are some errors made by Google Translate in translating English noun phrase into Indonesian. Those errors can be seen in the chart below:

Out of 80 data, Google Translate could give correct translation on English noun phrase into Indonesian as many as 39 data or 48.75%, while the rest of the data are incorrect (41 data or 51.25%).
V. Conclusion and Discussion

A. Conclusion

Based on the data which have been analyzed, the writer found 6 kinds of error on the translation of English noun phrase into Indonesian made by Google Translate. Here are the kinds of errors found:

1. Meaning
   Out of 80 data, there are 41 data which are incorrect (51.25%).

2. Word order
   Out of 67 data dealing with the word order, there are 22 data which are incorrect (32.84%).

3. Noun agreement
   Out of 42 data dealing with the noun + -s and the irregular form of plurality, there are 11 data which are incorrect (26.19%).

4. Misselection of words with similar meaning
   Out of 32 data dealing with the word selection of multiple meaning words, there are 11 data which are incorrect (34.38%).

5. Misselection of word class
   Out of 29 data dealing with the changing of word class, there are 10 data which are incorrect (34.48%).
6. Omission
Out of 19 data dealing with the words which are not translated, there are 9 data which are incorrect (47.37%).

Out of 80 data, Google Translate could give correct translation on English noun phrase into Indonesian as many as 39 data or 48.75%, while the rest of the data, that is 41 data or 51.25%, are incorrect.

Observing from the percentage of correct and incorrect translation results above, it can be concluded that Google Translate is unable to give correct translation on English noun phrase into Indonesian.

B. Suggestion
The followings are some suggestions which the writer wants to give concerning with the translation of English noun phrase into Indonesian by Google Translate:

1. This research paper could be a good reference for students who are learning translation, on noun phrase in particular.

2. This research paper is also useful for readers who find problems when translating English noun phrase into Indonesian by Google Translate.

3. For further research, this research paper could be guidance for another researcher in writing about the translation on other subject by Google Translate.

Bibliography


http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Google_Translate