GRAMMAR TRANSLATION METHOD AND DIRECT METHOD IN
TEACHING READING AT LPIA MARGONDA DEPOK
(A COMPARATIVE STUDY)

Written by:

Name : Yesica Hermita
NPM : 10605132
NIRM : 20053137200350130
Advisor 1 : Drs. Ichwan Suyudi, M.M.
Advisor 2 : Hawasi, S.S., S.Hum., M.A.

An Undergraduate Thesis
Submitted to the Faculty of Letters
As a Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for
Undergraduate Degree in English Literature

JAKARTA
2009

There are many methods used in teaching English. In this thesis the writer uses two different methods, grammar translation method and direct method as a comparative study to find the effective methods in teaching reading. The writer observed two groups namely Group A who were taught by using grammar translation method and Group B by using direct method.

The aims of this thesis are to find out the similarities and differences between grammar translation method and direct method, to describe the problems faced by the teacher when direct method and grammar translation method applied in teaching reading, to describe the solutions used by the teacher to overcome the problems when direct method and grammar translation method applied in teaching reading and to describe the method that is more effective in teaching reading class.

The results of the analysis shows that students are more interested in learning reading by using grammar translation method than using direct method. As the result of the study shows that t observed = 5.143 and the table t = 1.835 (observed t > table t). It means that teaching reading using grammar translation method is more effective than using direct method. The similarities between Grammar-Translation Method and Direct Method in teaching reading class on the writer point’s view one of them is exploiting one of the skills in teaching English that is reading. The Problems Faced by the teacher is students still have less understanding about the grammatical rules of the target language. The Solutions Used by the teacher that she has to review the lesson, tells the content of the text, and asks if there are difficult words.
INTRODUCTION

Language is a one device to communicate among people. Many people are speak in different kinds of language which on where they live. Many people are interested in learning a language especially English as the second language besides their native language. English as the target language is acquired in limited and artificial conditions. In the era of globalization people must master English language from the beginning in order to be successful.

There are many English institutions in Depok. One of those course institutions is Lembaga Pendidikan Indonesia Amerika (LPIA). The writer is interested in doing a research in teaching reading in LPIA Margonda Depok, because LPIA is one of the famous course institutions, and many people are interested in studying at that course institution. Besides, there are also various kinds of skills that we should have in learning English. One of them is reading skill, according to Wallace (1993:54) claimed that “early reading skills are exemplified by, for example, performance, and patterns, and phonic, and word recognition skill”.

There are some effective methods in teaching English in LPIA, there are four kinds of methods, and two of them are Direct Method and Grammar Translation Method. Direct method will guide you to use a target language communicatively. No translation is allowed, they have to use gesture or giving the synonym of the words.

According to Mackey (1965:151-153) most of the methods developed over the past few centuries were still in use in one form or another in various parts of the world. Direct method is the teaching manner that is used by the teacher directly face to face with the students to give the material in front of the class and it is very easy to make the students understandable to accept the teacher explanation. This method is usually used by the teacher to start the class with steps. While on the other hand, we also use Grammar Translation Method which also applied in some of institutions.

The Grammar Translation method is not new. It has had different names, but it has been used by the language teachers for many years. At one time it was called the Classical Method since it was first used in the teaching of the classical languages,
Latin and Greek (Chastain, 1988). Earlier in this century, this method was used for the purpose of helping students read and appreciate foreign language literature.

The writer is interested in conducting this research on this topic, because teaching method plays a big role in a process of learning. Theoretically, the successful of students in a process of learning is determined by the teacher in giving a good explanation by using a good teaching method. Practically, it will be good for the reader to know about the process of learning and understanding English through the one of the skill that is reading.

Discussion

The Similarities and the Differences between Grammar-Translation Method and Direct Method in Teaching Reading Class at LPIA

The similarities between Grammar-Translation Method and Direct Method in teaching reading class on the writer point’s view are:

1. Both of Grammar Translation Method and Direct Method are exploiting one of the skills in teaching English that is reading. According to (Dallman, et.al, 1982:22). It means that the reading is a verbal process which has a relation with other language skills namely, listening, speaking and writing, and reading is the process of reconstructing information from the author to the reader. Reading is an activity with a purpose. A person may read in order to gain information or verify existing knowledge, or in order to critique a writer’s ideas or writing style. (www.nclrc.org)

Traditionally, the purpose of learning to read in a language has been to have access to the literature written in that language. In the language instruction, reading materials have traditionally been chosen from literary texts represent higher forms of culture. In conclusion, reading is very important for most of people in order to get the information in the written form.

2. Encourage students to learn how to communicate in foreign language and read and appreciate foreign language literature.
3. These methods also talk about grammar rules and vocabulary in the target language.
The differences between Grammar-Translation Method and Direct Method in teaching reading class on the writer point’s view are:
1. In Grammar-Translation Method, it is allowed to translate, while there is no translation allowed in Direct Method.
2. The ability to communicate in target language is not the goal of foreign language instruction in Grammar-Translation Method, while it is one of the goals in Direct Method.
3. It is not a must to use the target language during the class in Grammar-Translation Method, while it is a must to use target language in Direct Method.

Teaching Reading Class in Group A
The Steps in Teaching Reading Class by Using Grammar-Translation Method in Group A.
1. Opening
   a. The teacher greets the students, then the teacher asks the students about the reading passage, for example: "How many paragraphs in the passage" or "what do the pictures in the lesson contain?" where is each scene taking place or what is happening.
   b. The teacher writes the key words of the topic on the board and explaining them to the students. Giving simple information about the reading topic, same to the students' level. For example, translate the idea of the topic by giving them the idea in their language and culture.

2. Material Delivery
   a. Teacher explains the benefits of comprehending this passage, for instance they develop students' awareness of the reading process and reading
strategies by asking students to think and talk about how they read in their native language.

b. The students read the passage in 20 minutes, the teacher encourage students to read and learn by giving students some choice of reading material.

This is the materials that are used by the teacher in teaching reading:

Unit 1. Our changing lifestyles:
Trends and Fads

These days’ urban lifestyles seem to change very fast. It is more than just clothing and hairstyles that are in style one year and out of date the next; it’s a whole way of living. One year people wear sunglasses on top of their heads and wear jeans and boots; they drink white wine and sushi at Japanese restaurants; for exercise they jog several miles a day. However, the next year everything has changed. Women wear long skirts; people drinks expensive water from France and eat pasta at Italian restaurants; everyone seems to be exercising at health clubs. Then suddenly, it has changed again. People wear only natural fabric (safe for the environment); they drink gourmet coffee and eat Thai food; for both leisure and exercise, they go rollerblading. Almost nothing in modern life escapes the influence of fashion; food, music, exercise, books, slang words, movies, furniture, places to visit, even names go in and out of fashion. For a while, it seems that all parents are naming their babies Heather, Dawn, Eric, Adam. These names are “in”. Then, suddenly, these same names are “out”, and Tiffany and Jason are “in”. It’s almost impossible to write about specific fads because these interests that people enthusiastically follow can change very quickly. In the United States, even people can be “in” and “out”. Like people in any country, Americans enjoy following the lives of celebrities: movie stars, sports heroes, famous artists, politicians, and the like. But Americans also pay a lot of attention to people who have no special ability and have done nothing very special. In 1981, for example, an unknown elderly woman appeared in a TV commercial in which she looked at a very small hamburger and complained loudly “Where’s the beef”? These three words made her famous. Suddenly she appeared in magazines and newspapers and TV shows. She was immediately popular. She was “in”. In 1987, an examiner in Dallas, Texas, decided that he would be very happy if he could find more customers for his small business; he needed more people to pay him to kill the insects and rats in their houses. He put an unusual advertisement in a Dallas newspaper: He offered to pay $1,000 to the person who could find the biggest cockroach. This strange offer made him suddenly famous. There were stories about him nationwide—from New York to California. He was “in”. However, this kind of fame does not last long. Such people are famous for a very short time.

This is the essence, the central quality, of a fad; it doesn’t last long. Some fads disappear before we have all even heard of them. How many people remember Green Peace swimsuits? (They changed color to indicate populated water) and then there was” Beethoven Bread.” Popular in Japan in 1994, it was expensive-$20 for one loaf. It was made while classical music played in the kitchen. The woman who created this bread emphasized that “bread doesn’t like rock music”. A person who participates in fads should remember that they come and go very fast, and they often come back in style after 10 to 15 years of being “out”. It might be a good idea never to throw anything away. Mickey mouse watches and Nehru jackets may soon “in” again! What causes fads come and go? And why do so many people follow them? Although clothing designers and manufactures influence fads in fashion because they want to make a profit, this desire for money doesn’t explain fads in other areas, such as
language. For example, why have teenagers in past twenty-five years used at different times the slang words groovy, boss, awesome, rad, or tubular instead of simply saying “wonderful”? According to Jack Santino, an expert in popular culture, people who follow fads are not irrational; they simply want to be part of something new and creative, and they fell good when they are part of an “in group”. Dr. Santino believes that fads are common in any country that has a strong customer economy—e.g., Britain, Japan, Germany and United States. However, in the United States there is an additional reason for fads: Most Americans seem to feel that something is wrong if there isn’t frequent change in their lives.

Dr. Santino, points out that it’s sometimes difficult to see the difference between fad and a trend. A fad, he says, lasts a very short time and is not important. A trend lasts much longer. A recent trend is the interest in good health, but many fads come from this trend: aerobic dancing, special diets, cholesterol-counting, organic vegetables, and the like. A trend in the 1980’s was use of personal computers; certain computer games were fads. However, these days we can’t really continue to call computers a “trend” because now they have become an essential part of everyday life. An exciting trend began in Europe in the mid-1990s: The cultural borders between countries began to break down. Travelers from other parts of the world noticed that “Eurokids” (under 25 years old) from Lisbon to Stockholm, from London to Athens seemed to be very similar to each other. They had more in common with each other than with older people from their own countries. These young people all followed the same fads in fashion (the colors and designs of Spain), music (rave music from Italy, Belgium, and Great Britain), and food (tapas). Barcelona, Spain became the “style capital.” These Eurokids had the same lifestyle and values. For example they were worried about the environment; one report noted, “They concerned more about rain forests than clothes.” Some of the Eurokids’ fads will certainly disappear and others will come along, but it will be interesting to see if the trend continues and becomes a true part of European culture.

c. The teacher explains and asks the difficult words in the reading passage. In this case the teacher usually asks the students to do the translation of reading passage.

3. Closing

a. The teacher gives an evaluation; this contains answering the book’s exercises and questions that related to the reading passage. If the students answer these questions correctly with a less interference by the teacher, the goals of the lesson are achieved.

b. The teacher gives him enough time to evaluate the students understanding of the lesson. Therefore, the teacher can repeat the lesson to the students who do not understand in a quick and comprehensive way. Here, the students are very interesting and enjoying the lesson when the teacher applied this method to this group.
The Problems Faced by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group A

The Problems Faced by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group A based on the writer point’s view are:

1. Students still have less understanding about the grammatical rules of the target language when the teacher asks them to translate the reading passage. For example, the students still do not know how to translate the sentence in the passage because they have a lack of understanding in learning grammar.

2. The students can not answer the questions given from the teacher and having difficulties in vocabulary. For example, when the teacher asks about some questions related to the passages, they usually can not answer correctly, considering that it might be because some of them are having some lacks in mastering vocabulary.

The Solutions Used by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group A

The Solutions Used by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group A based on the writer point’s view are:

1. The teacher has to review the lesson, tells the content of the text, and asks if there are difficult words, then the teacher asks the students to read the passage paragraph by paragraph also conclude the passage by paraphrasing: stopping at the end of a section to check comprehension by restating the information and ideas in the text.

2. To overcome this problem, the teacher should give direct example when the teacher asks some questions to the students and ask them to guess the meaning of the new words by guessing without looking up in dictionary.
Teaching Reading Class in Group B

The Steps in Teaching Reading Class by Using Direct Method in Group B

1. Opening

   a. The teacher greets the students, then the teacher asks the students about the reading passage, for example: "How many paragraphs in the passage" or "what do the pictures in the lesson contain?" where is each scene taking place or what is happening.

   b. The teacher writes the key words of the topic on the board and explaining them to the students. Giving simple information about the reading topic, same to the students' level. For example, translate the idea of the topic by giving them the idea in their language and culture.


   Direct method is the teaching manner that is used by the teacher directly face to face with the students to give the material in front of the class and it is very easy to make the students understandable to accept the teacher explanation. The steps of teaching will be like this:

   a. The teacher speaks with understandable language. The teacher should use everyday language and sentences that are used by the teacher should not too long, because it can make the clarifier become easier.

   b. The teacher divides about the matter that will be given. The teacher reviews all of the matter that has given before she continues the next subject. Dividing the materials become more several mains of problem. The amounts of those materials are not taken all. After one main problem has been solving, the teacher is intended to continue another main problem.
c. The teacher gives a detail explanation about the reading passage and also the example to the students. The teacher asks the students to read the passages in 20 minutes then asks the students to find some difficult words. Speech method is the way of the teacher to give explanations. Usually the teacher gives so detail about the problem and the style of this method is using an everyday language.

For instance the teacher asks the students to discuss the reading passage such as:

The first topic is about Methods of Education: East Versus West

1. What is the system of education in your country like? How is it different from the North American System?

2. Which system do you prefer?

3. What other educational methods are there? Describe them and tell some of their advantages and disadvantages?

In this discussion the purpose of the teacher is making the students able to speak the target language by exploiting reading, making them brave to express their opinion based on the reading passage.

3. Closing

a. The teacher gives an evaluation; this contains answering the book's exercises and questions that related to the reading passage. If the students answer these questions correctly with a less interference by the teacher, the goals of the lesson are achieved.

b. The teacher gives him enough time to evaluate the students understanding of the lesson. Therefore, the teacher can repeat the lesson to the students
who do not understand in a quick and comprehensive way. Here, the students are very interesting and enjoying the lesson when the teacher applied this method to this.

**The Problems Faced by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class by using Direct Method in Group B.**

The Problems Faced by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group B based on the writer point’s view are:

1. Students still have a problem in their fluency and accuracy in speaking the target language. Students still have a fearness to express their ideas. They still cannot pronounce the words correctly.
2. Sometimes the students do not understand about what the teacher speaks about. For example, when the teacher asks the students about the questions related to the passages, some of them become passive and silence, because they do not know how to answer the question.

**The Solutions Used by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class by using Direct Method in Group B**

The Solutions Used by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group B based on the writer point’s view are:

1. To overcome this problem the teacher encourages them to use English appropriately; the teacher should make it clear that there is not a total ban on their own language depends on what’s happening. Teacher has to create such a classroom atmosphere to make students ready to understand and talk about the dialogues or the passages.
2. It might be a common situation where the students sometimes do not understand about the material that is given by the teacher, then, the teacher should explain the
materials clearly to the students and encourage them to be active and try to answer the questions.

3. To overcome this problem, the teacher should create English environment, she should speak English for the majority of the time. Then, it is better if the teacher create conversations about the passages.

**The Result of Data Analysis in Group A and B.**

**The Result of Data Analysis in Group A (Experimental Group)**

**Table 1: Computation of the t-observed for Experimental Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>n₁</th>
<th>x₁</th>
<th>x₂</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
<td>366</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

X₁ = Average score of the experimental group

= 36

n₁ = number of students in the experimental group
\[ X_1 = \frac{36}{4} = 9 \]

\[ SS_1 = \text{Sum of the squared deviation scores at the experimental group} \]

\[ \Sigma x_1^2 = 366 \]

\[ SS_1 = \Sigma x - \frac{\left( \Sigma x \right)^2}{n_1} \]

\[ = 366 - \frac{(36)^2}{4} = 366 - \frac{1296}{4} = 366 - 324 = 42 \]
The Result of Data Analysis in Group B (Control Group)

Table 2: Computation of the t-observed for Control group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>$n_2$</th>
<th>$x_1$</th>
<th>$x_2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$X_2 = \text{Average score of the control group}$

$= 22$

$\Pi_2 = \text{number of students in the control group}$

$= 4$

$X_2 = \frac{\Pi_2}{4}$
\[ SS_2 = \text{Sum of the squared deviation scores at the control group} \]

\[ \Sigma x^2 = 122 \]

\[ SS_2 = \frac{\Sigma x - (\Sigma x)^2}{4} \]

\[ = \frac{122 - (22)^2}{4} \]

\[ = \frac{122 - 484}{4} \]

\[ = 5.5 \]
\[ t = \frac{X_1 - X_2}{\sqrt{\frac{SS_1 + SS_2}{n_1 + n_2 - 2} \left[ \frac{1}{n_1} + \frac{1}{n_2} \right]}} \]

\[ = \frac{36 - 22}{\sqrt{\frac{4 \cdot 2}{4 + 4 - 2} \left[ \frac{1}{4} + \frac{1}{4} \right]}} \]

\[ = \frac{14}{14} \]

\[ = 1 \]
\[
\int \frac{43}{6} + \frac{2}{8}
\]

\[
= \frac{14}{14} - \frac{\sqrt{7.16 + 0.25}}{14}
\]

\[
= \frac{\sqrt{7.41}}{14}
\]

\[
= 2.722
\]

\[
= 5.143
\]
To find the value of t-table of degrees of freedom (df) we can use the formula below: 

\[ df = n_1 + n_2 - 2 \]

\[ = 4 + 4 - 2 \]

\[ = 6 \]

To find the value of table-t-of degrees of freedom (df ) for 6 = The closest minimum score of degrees of freedom (df ) for 6 is 5 with table-t = 2.015, the closest maximum score of degrees of freedom (df ) for 6 is 7 with table-t = 1.895. The difference of the two df is 7-5 = 2, The difference of table-t is = 2.015- 1.895 = 0.12

0.12 x ( 7-6 ) differences of observed df and table df 0.06 x 1 = 0.06

Thus, table-t of df for 6 is 1.895-0.06 = 1.835

Observed t is higher than table-t (5.143 > 1.835)

**Conclusion**

**The Similarities and The differences between Grammar-Translation Method and Direct Method**

The similarities between Grammar-Translation Method and Direct Method in teaching reading class on the writer point’s view are: both of Grammar Translation
Method and Direct Method are exploiting one of the skills in teaching English that is reading, encourage students to learn how to communicate in foreign language and read and appreciate foreign language literature, these methods also talk about grammar rules and vocabulary in the target language.

The differences between Grammar-Translation Method and Direct Method in teaching reading class on the writer point’s view are: in Grammar-Translation Method, it is allowed to translate, while there is no translation allowed in Direct Method, the ability to communicate in target language is not the goal of foreign language instruction in Grammar-Translation Method, while it is one of the goals in Direct Method, it is not a must to use the target language during the class in Grammar-Translation Method, while it is a must to use target language in Direct Method

The Problems Faced in Group A and B

The Problems Faced by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group A based on the writer point’s view are: students still have less understanding about the grammatical rules of the target language when the teacher asks them to translate the reading passage, the students can not answer the questions given from the teacher and having difficulties in vocabulary.

The Problems Faced by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group B based on the writer point’s view are: students still have a problem in their fluency and accuracy in speaking the target language, students still have a fear ness to express their ideas, they still can not pronounce the words correctly sometimes the students do not understand about what the teacher speaks about, and the students keep using their own language.

The Solutions Used by the Teacher in Teaching Reading in Group A and B
The Solutions Used by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group A based on the writer point’s view are: the teacher has to review the lesson, tells the content of the text, and asks if there are difficult words, then the teacher asks the students to read the passage paragraph by paragraph also conclude the passage by paraphrasing: stopping at the end of a section to check comprehension by restating the information and ideas in the text, and the teacher should give direct example when the teacher asks some questions to the students and ask them to guess the meaning of the new words by guessing without looking up in dictionary.

The Solutions Used by the Teacher in Teaching Reading Class in Group B based on the writer point’s view are: to overcome this problem the teacher encourages them to use English appropriately; the teacher should make it clear that there is not a total ban on their own language depends on what’s happening. Teacher has to create such a classroom atmosphere to make to students ready to understand and talk about the dialogues or the passages. It might be a common situation where the students sometimes do not understand about the material that is given by the teacher, then, the teacher should explain the materials clearly to the students and encourage them to be active and try to answer the questions, and to overcome this problem, the teacher should create English environment, she should speak English for the majority of the time. Then, it is better if the teacher create conversations about the passages.

The writer also found out that the comparison of students’ achievement between using Grammar-Translation Method and Direct Method can be described as follows:

Students in experimental group (Grammar-Translation Method)
The average score ($X_1$) is 9
The sum squared deviation ($\Sigma x_1$) is 36
The total number of students: 4

Meanwhile the result of control group (Direct Method) can be seen as follows:
The average score ($X_1$) is 5.5
The sum squared deviation ($\Sigma x_1$) is 22
The total number of students: 4
It means between two groups, experimental and control group, experimental group which implemented Grammar-Translation Method get higher achievement than control group which implemented Direct Method.

References


Fisher and Yates: *Statistical Tables for Biological, Agricultural, and Medical Research*.

[www.wikigogy.org](http://www.wikigogy.org)


[www.gifted.uconn.edu](http://www.gifted.uconn.edu)

[www.answers.com](http://www.answers.com)

[www.statsoft.com](http://www.statsoft.com)

([www.nclrc.org](http://www.nclrc.org))